## EVALUATION REPORT Women@Work Program (2015-16)







Submitted by 4th Wheel on 25th September, 2016.





#### **EMpower Foundation**

The Emerging Markets Foundation is a not-for-profit organization that connects the resources of Emerging Markets (EM) professionals worldwide with the vitality of local organizations in emerging market countries. Founded in 2000 by financial professionals from the EM community who wanted to give back to the countries where they did business, EMpower makes grants and provides technical assistance through partnerships with local organizations working to improve conditions for young people in their communities.

### SAATH Charitable Trust

Saath Charitable Trust, set up in 1989, works with slum residents, migrants, minorities, children, women, youth and vulnerable people in urban and rural areas. In the last 25 years Saath has worked in Gujarat, Rajasthan and Maharashtra and has affected more than 4,60,576 individuals.

## Index

| Торіс                        | Page No. |
|------------------------------|----------|
| Introduction                 | 6        |
| Program details              | 9        |
| Evaluation design            | 12       |
| Adolescent findings          | 16       |
| Women findings               | 29       |
| Training feedback            | 47       |
| Media coverage               | 53       |
| Learning and recommendations | 54       |

## **Executive Summary**

The Women@Work Program, designed and implemented by SAATH in collaboration with Empower Foundation, is focused on training adolescent girls and women in trades and micro entrepreneurship activities they would not traditionally engage in. The objective is to widen the scope of livelihood opportunities and thus empower the beneficiaries socially and economically and in the process, develop their self-confidence, self-worth as well as other life skills.

The overall outreach of the program between June 2015 and September 2016 was 507 participants, comprising of 151 adolescent girls and 356 women in urban slums of Ahmedabad.

This report aims at assessing the short-term and medium-term change the program has created in the lives of the participants. 8 different impact areas were examined which

were divided into outcome indicators, comprising of attitudes, soft skills, technical skills, financial literacy and health awareness as short-term indicators, and family support, employment status, income levels and assets in the medium-term. Each indicator was given weights according to their relevance, respective to each target group for the calculation of the overall impact of the program on participants.

Baseline and endline data was collected before the start and at the end of the training program to analyse short-term impact, and additional telephonic interviews were conducted three months post the program to capture medium-term outcomes. Case study and participants' feedback were collected which provided further insights.

The study finds that the Women@Work program contributed to an average positive change of 31.24% in the women and adolescents', in terms of identified impact indicators. Adolescents recorded an impact percentage of 32.32% whereas impact on women was calculated at 30.16%. The calculation of the impact index shows that the program has had more of an impact on adolescents than women , but both figures show a very promising change in the lives of the adolescents and women who underwent the training.

The report is structured as follows. It first focuses on outlining the program and training activities of Women@Work, introducing the program to readers. The research design then describes the methodological approach, tools used and limitations to the study. The third chapter details the profiles and the calculated impact index of the adolescent trainees. The fourth chapter focuses on women trainees. The concluding part of this report consists of recommendations and learning for future implementation.

SAATH and EMpower Foundation initiated the Women@Work program in 2014. The program focuses on providing skill enhancement training in nontraditional trades and micro entrepreneurship, to facilitate livelihood creation for adolescent girls and women.

## Introduction

Out of the total working population in India only 2% are engaged in formal employment. Women, who comprise a considerable part of the total workforce, are largely concentrated in the informal sector. A large chunk of these women are engaged in informal jobs, primarily due to lack of skill training and education.

According to a report by the 'Gender and Economic Policy Discussion Forum', in India out of 148 million women in the workforce, 135 million are engaged in informal jobs that are characterised by low earnings, low productivity, poor working conditions and lack of social protection.

Thus, there is a strong need for making skill and livelihood training accessible and affordable for women, that matches changing needs of the market. Hereby, training programs should go beyond traditional occupations and explore trades and businesses that are usually not associated with women, to increase options for employment and income generation.

Building on these findings, SAATH envisions 'inclusive and empowered communities and individuals'. The organization designed and drafted the Women@Work Program in Ahmedabad, supported by the EMpower Foundation.

The aim of this program is to impart to women and adolescent girls skills and trainings that are often seen as unfit for a woman. Thus, along with empowering women this program also looks to change gender based stereotypes and prejudices that are deeply rooted in Indian society.

### The Program - A bold stride towards gender equity

Women @ Work is a skill development and enhancement program primarily focused on adolescent girls between 16-18 years of age and women in the age group of 18-25 years.

The program is built around an intensive and comprehensive training module focusing on varied aspects of non-traditional life skills, entrepreneurship and micro enterprise (ME) formation.

Components on safety, self-defence, career guidance and counselling, financial literacy, marketing strategies and knowledge on technology are also weaved into the trainings to build up capacities beyond technical trainings.

The defined objectives of the program are as follows:

Objective 1: Introduce non-traditional skills and livelihood options to adolescent girls.

Objective 2: Provide training on nontraditional skills and establish market linkages for women to launch their career plans and improve their chances of employment. The program was conducted between June 2015 and September 2016.

Adolescent girls and women residing in vulnerable slum communities in the city of Ahmedabad, Gujarat, were the identified beneficiaries for this program.

7 training centres conducted the program in slum areas of Bapunagar, Behrampur, Bhairavnath, Fatehwadi, Khodiyarnagar, Meghaninagar and Saraspur.

Women and adolescents were to receive two separate trainings. Women were trained in nontraditional technical trades, like electrician, mobile repairing, masonry and petrol pump operating, whereas girls were trained in Micro Entrepreneurship. Additional components of life skills, financial literacy, health awareness and use of technology were common to both target groups. Since adolescents and women were keen to participate in all aspects offered, there were some adolescents who attended the non-traditional technical trade trainings.

Education and Communication (IEC) materials, road show/auto mike etc. to encourage participation in the Women@Work Program.

Moreover, counselling was also extended to prospective participants and their family members to give clarity on the impact the program would have on beneficiaries and thus ensure family support and community rapport. These continuous efforts enabled Saath to achieve their target of reaching out to over 500 participants in the second year of the program.

"Initially I was very hesitant to send my wife for the training program. Since it was not a conventional women training like tailoring, convincing my parents to send her for an electrician training was tough. The SAATH team dedicated a lot of time in explaining the benefits and aims of the program, which eventually convinced my family. I am so glad we agreed since we see the increase in her self confidence and she now contributes Rs. 4000 every month to our household by taking up small electrician jobs in our slum area." - Siddharth Padhiyar, 35, Husband of Meghaninagar participant.

### Mobilisation and rapport building activities

To ensure that the core aspects of the program were effectively communicated and to encourage women and girls to participate in the program, there was a strong need for intensive and focused community mobilization.

Saath engaged in different mobilization techniques like door-todoor mobilization, Information,





Household visits



Distribution of awareness material



Counselling of families



Awareness campaigns



Community meetings



Participant counselling

# **Program details**

The two month module trained women in technical trades like electrician, mobile repairing, masonry and petrol pump operation. Adolescent girls were trained primarily in Micro Entrepreneurship (ME). SAATH's training program goes beyond mere technical input. Life skills, entrepreneurship, integration of technology, financial literacy and management, marketing strategies, career guidance and counselling, health, safety and self-defence run commonly through all trainings.

Between the period of June 2015 to May 2016, **43 trainings have been completed** across the 7 centers in slum areas across Ahmedabad city.

The highest number of trainings took place at Meghaninagar (20%), followed by Bapunagar, Fatehwadi and Behrampura with 17%, 14% and 12% trainings undertaken respectively. **learning opportunities** during their training courses. For this purpose, additional extra-curricular activities were organised for each training batch to ensure maximum learning and impact.

**19 exposure visits were organized.** Women were taken to electrician workshops near their slums for

Bhairavnath, Juhapura and Vejalpur account for only 2% of the total women and adolescents trained. Various activities are organised for each training batch to ensure maximum participation and impact. practical learning and exposure. Participants of the mobile

Out of the 534 enrolled, **507 participants completed the training, representing a completion rate of 94%.** 151 were in the 16-17 age group (adolescents), 300 in the 18-25 age group (women) and the remainder 56 women participants in the 26-35 age group who were included on special consideration.

**151 were trained in ME** and **356 in different technical trades** –electrician (188), mobile repairing (124) masonry (23), petrol pump operating (21).

In addition, SAATH places high value on **empowerment and experiential** 

repairing training were taken to China Market at Relief Road and mobile shops at Sarkhej. This helped them to get a practical understanding of mobile repairing. Women were also taken to petrol pumps to get hands-on experience of working at them.

On **Women's day** ten women were invited by Novotel hotel where they were oriented to the working of the electrical engineering department. Further exposure visits were organised to Science City in Gandhinagar. The Women @ Work program was even showcased at a local event called the W-Project where trainees and their trades were showcased and marketed. 8 health awareness programs were conducted, focusing on women health, prenatal and postnatal care.

### 151 girls received career counselling.

Participants, especially adolescent girls were provided with SAATH specialised career counselling sessions on higher education prospects and employment opportunities.

Recreational activities like **picnics**, **parties and traditional dress days** were also organised for participants to maintain their interest and make the training fun and engaging.

Every two months, all the trainees were brought together to interact and discuss their aspirations, learning and progress in the program.

All the trainings had a component of **technology education**, i.e. using smart phones and computers. It was initially meant only for adolescent girls, since women were being trained in technical trades. Owing to the interest of all participants in technology, this component was offered to all trainees at the course.



Computer training



Exposure visit to Shell Petrol Pump



SAATH specialised career guidance



Electrician Training



Ashvini Parmar at a women related conference in Kerala



Visibility of Women@Work at the W-Trunk exhibition organised at Ahmedabad Haat



Exposure visit to electrical shop



Health awareness session with Dr. Kirti



Relationship building party



Electrician exposure visit at Novotel Engineering Department



Visit to Science City

# **Evaluation design**

The study was undertaken to answer the following research question: Has the Women@Work program caused an effective change in the participants' skill set, level of awareness, employment or education status and role in their family?

### The following sub-questions guided the research

- What is the effectiveness of the program with regard to defined indicators?

- To which target group - adolescents or women - has the program proven to be more effective?

- To which extent could stereotypes and stigma be overcome regarding female engagement in non-traditional trades and micro entrepreneurship?

### Logic Model

As a first step, we set up a Logic model to clarify and graphically display what Women@Work intends to do and what it envisions to accomplish. Logic models are a visual representation to depict the logical relationships between resources, activities, outputs and outcomes of a program.

The Logic Model forms the basis of our research, as it summarises key elements of Women @ Work and clarifies on intended outcomes.

**Inputs** comprise resources dedicated to or consumed by the program, i.e. human and financial resources.

**Outputs** refer to direct products of program activities. These training activities for Women@Work are described in the section before.

**Outcomes** illustrate the benefits for participants during and after program activities. Here we differentiate between

- short term outcomes: changes in skill, attitudes and knowledge
- medium outcomes: changes in family support, employment and education status along with a change in income levels
- long term outcomes: changes in life conditions

The study focuses on **short and medium term outcomes** of the Women@Work program, as the time span does not allow to assess long term outcomes yet.

### Logic model of the Women@Work program

| INPUTS  | OUTPUTS  | OUTCOMES   |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|
|   | - Mobilisation campaigns   | Short-Term<br>Indicators<br>(Measured in endline)        | Medium-Term<br>Indicators<br>(Measured in telephone<br>interviews) | Long-Term<br>Impact  |  |  |
| - Staff & trainers<br>- Training modules      | - 2 Month<br>training<br>program   | Attitudes, Self-<br>esteem and<br>Confidence             | Family support and girl's role in family                           | girls and<br>women<br>financially and<br>to bring about                          |  |  |
| - Training centres<br>- Costs and<br>finances | - Extra<br>curricular<br>activities  | Soft Skills<br>Technical Skills                          | Employment/<br>education status                                    | a discussion<br>and hence a<br>change in the<br>society about<br>views and       |  |  |
|   | - Job<br>placements,<br>market-<br>linkage<br>facilitation,<br>and<br>entrepreneur | Financial Literacy<br>and Engagement<br>Health Awareness | Income levels and assets   | stereotypes<br>pertaining to<br>the<br>occupations<br>that woman<br>can take up. |  |  |

### Impact assessment framework

The program's effectiveness was measured in terms of substantive changes on the program beneficiaries specific to defined indicators. As there is no one-size-fits all approach to measure effectiveness, 4th Wheel designed a contextualized impact assessment framework to make consistent and unbiased conclusions on the changed caused by the Women@Work program.

During the conceptualization of the evaluation design, the eight most relevant aspects/impact indicators were identified, and covered in the research. During consultations with SAATH and EMpower, these aspects were then weighted respectively to both target groups. Two out of eight indicators (Employment status and Income levels and assets) only correspond to women and hence have been assigned a zero weightage for girls. Similarly, change in education status corresponds to adolescents only and zero weight age has been assigned to women under this indicator.

| Indicator                                    | Weightage   |       |  |  |
|--|-------------|-------|--|--|
| indicator                                    | Adolescents | Women |  |  |
| Short Term                                   |             |       |  |  |
| Attitudes, self-esteem and confidence levels | 10          | 5     |  |  |
| Soft skills                                  | 10          | 5     |  |  |
| Technical skills                             | 15          | 10    |  |  |
| Financial literacy and engagement            | 15          | 15    |  |  |
| Health awareness                             | 10          | 5     |  |  |
| Medium Term                                  |             |       |  |  |
| Family support and girl's role in her family | 20          | 20    |  |  |
| Employment/ education status                 | 20          | 20    |  |  |
| Income levels and assets                     | 0           | 20    |  |  |

### **Pretest-Post test**

To evaluate the outcome of the program, a pretest-post test design has been applied to measure the degree of change occurring as a result of the treatment

- A baseline survey was conducted within the first ten days of the training to provide a pre-program information base against which to monitor and assess the Women@Work effectiveness during implementation and after the activity
- An endline survey was conducted in the last week of the training program to capture the same indicators as the baseline for comparison
- Follow up telephonic interviews were conducted three months after training completion to identify medium -term trends on the sustainability of the training impact.
- In addition, semi-structured interviews were conducted with family members and trainers to gather qualitative inputs.

### **Impact Calculations**

The following calculations were made per indicator Short term Impact: I(W) = (%E - %B ) x W

 $\label{eq:model} \begin{array}{l} \mbox{Medium term Impact: } I(W) = (\% T - \% B \ ) \ x \ W \\ I = Impact, \ E \ = \ Endline, \ B = \ Baseline, \ T = \ Tele, \ W = \ Weightage \end{array}$ 

Most short-term indicators were analysed based on the difference in scores from baseline to end line studies, whereas most medium-term indicators were measured based on the difference in scores from telephone interviews to baseline data. Mostly likert scales were used to quantify outcomes. In some cases, absolute values were used for calculations which were recorded in telephone interviews. Data was also used from SAATH records for indicators relating to employment status, income levels and market linkages. Relying on different kind of data sources and data triangulation ensures internal validity of the study.

### Sampling

Ideally, 100% sample size was pursued throughout the data collection. Not all participants could be reached out to in both baseline and endline study due to drop outs and a delayed start of the evaluation data collection. Only 286 training participants could be reached through telephonic interviews, which affects the validity of the study in respect to medium term outcomes. Since there was a difference in the number of baseline, endline and telephone interview samples, values have been weighted to adjust the difference, in places where necessary.

| Study Element                      | Sample Size (%)   | No. of respondents |  |
|------------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|--|
| Baseline                           | 89                | 479                |  |
| Endline                            | 93                | 500                |  |
| Telephone Interviews               | 56                | 286                |  |
| Trainers and Parents<br>interviews | Upon availability |                    |  |

### Limitations of the study

- 1) During data collection, some women and adolescents were illiterate and could not fill in the questionnaires by themselves. Hence, trainers or the research team had to capture their responses and fill them in. In addition, due to lack of space, participants were sitting closely to each other and exchanging their responses among the group. Both factors might lead to slight deviations of results, as biases in the answers might occur.
- 2) To measure medium-term outcomes telephonic interviews were set up with the participants. However, outreach to the participants after three month of program completion was a challenge. Only 286 out of 507 participants could be reached, representing a response rate of 56%. This affects the generalization of results as potential bias might occur. The participants reached via telephone might have unobserved characteristics that might differ from the ones who were not reached. This participant bias might influence cumulated questionnaire responses and hence outcomes. Also, owing to the restricted time that could be allotted to a telephone interview, the survey was not exhaustive and covered only essential questions, which made it shorter and not as concise as baseline and end line studies. This restricted the variables which could be compared after three months of the training.
- 3) A long-term impact of the project cannot be established as the chosen time-frame is too less. To do so, the research team suggests a panel data set up, where participants are tracked over time to see the occurred change. Long-term impact can then be evidenced more rigorously.

# Adolescents Demographics

The demographic profile of 151adolescents is outlined below. Details like religion, level of education, employment status, level of income and reasons for joining the training provide an understanding of the participants.

For the purpose of this study, 'adolescent girls' include all training participants who fell in the age group of 16 to 18 years. There were a total of 151 adolescents who attended the program.

The larger proportion of the adolescent girls i.e. **84.11% were Hindu** with a mere 9.27% being Muslims. 6% responses were unrecorded.



More than half i.e. **57.62% of the trainees in this category have completed high school**. 5 adolescents, accounting for 3.31% were illiterate. The remainder stated to have completed primary, higher secondary school and 3 girls were graduates, with 10% of the responses being unrecorded.

With regards to employment status, 34.44% of the respondents were studying followed closely by 31.79% who stayed at home and engaged in household chores. For those who were employes, activities included own businesses, beautician assignments etc.

When asked if they wish to work **96 of the adolescent girls, accounting for 63.58%,** responded positively. On the other hand 29.14%, were not interested in employment. Remaining responses were not recorded.

Opportunities for employment and learning a new skill with 34.44% and 33.77% respectively, were the top reasons stated for enrolling in the Women@Work program. Personal interest in the skill training program was the least stated reason as motivation for joining the program.



# **Evaluation findings**

| Short- Term<br>Indicators                        | Sub-Indicator                              | Measurement   | Impact  | Average<br>Impact | Weighted<br>Impact |
|--|--|---|---------|-------------------|--------------------|
|  |  | Role in Family  | 22%     |                   |                    |
|  | More positive                              | Women can do job as<br>men  | 14%     |                   |                    |
|  | outlook on life                            | Financial contribution  | 16%     |                   |                    |
| Attitudes  |  | Independent post<br>training                                      | 91%     |                   |                    |
| (10%)  | More confident<br>to play an active        | Encounter problems<br>as women                                    | 20%     | 40%               | 4.01%              |
|  | role in the<br>community                   | Involved in<br>community<br>development efforts                   | 2%      |                   |                    |
|  | Greater<br>aspirations and<br>career goals | Top life-goals  | 117%    |                   |                    |
|  | Better                                     | Confident in speaking<br>in front of crowd                        | 21%     | 19%               | 1.90%              |
|  | communication<br>skills                    | Can maintain eye<br>contact during<br>conversation                | 11%     |                   |                    |
| Soft Skills<br>(10%)                             | Aware of<br>leadeship<br>qualities         | Top qualities of a leader   | 30%     |                   |                    |
|  | Time-<br>Management<br>Skills              | Organizes daily<br>schedule and sticks to<br>it                   | 25%     |                   |                    |
|  | Aware of stress<br>management<br>methods   | Can look at problems<br>objectively and find<br>solutions to them | 9%      |                   |                    |
| Technical<br>skills                              | Increase in<br>exposure to<br>technology   | Weekly Computer<br>usage  | 2.00%   | 21.5%             | 3.23%              |
| (15%)  | Technical<br>knowledge                     | A grade scores on<br>technical tests                              | 41%     |                   |                    |
| Financial<br>Literacy and<br>Management<br>(15%) | Aware of<br>financial<br>institutions      | Top places for making<br>savings                                  | 106.78% | 49%               | 7.39%              |
|  | Bank Accounts                              | Has a bank account  | 33.82%  | 47%               | 1.3770             |

| Short- Term<br>Indicators | Sub-Indicator                | Measurement                        | Impact | Average<br>Impact | Weighted<br>Impact |
|---------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------------|--------|-------------------|--------------------|
| Financial<br>Literacy and | Bank accounts                | Regularity of visiting<br>the bank | 16.87% |                   |                    |
| Management                | Access to Credit             | Never availed of loans             | 39.71% |                   |                    |
| Health<br>(10%)           | Awareness on<br>institutions | Institutions mentioned             | 27%    | 27%               | 2.70%              |

| Medium- Term<br>Indicators | Sub-Indicator   | Measurement                                    | Impact | Average<br>Impact | Weighted<br>Impact |
|----------------------------|---|--|--------|-------------------|--------------------|
| Family                     | Level of stress<br>faced by the girl                                | Family is supportive of decisions              | 43%    | 29%               | 7.22%              |
| Support and<br>Role in the | (at home/in<br>society  | Family supports pursuing of career             | 18%    |                   |                    |
| Family<br>(20%)            | Change of status<br>in the family<br>(economic,<br>decision making) | Consulted for major<br>decisions in the family | 47%    |                   |                    |
|                            | Interest in STEM  | Interest in pursuing a<br>STEM job             | 11%    |                   |                    |
| Education                  | subjects  | Knowhow on STEM                                | 8%     | 36%               | 5.87%              |
| (20%)                      | Pursuing STEM   | Currently Studying                             | 42%    | 50%               | 5.0770             |
|                            | subjects in<br>schools  | Interest in studying<br>further                | 57%    |                   |                    |

### **TOTAL IMPACT = 32.32%**

As can be seen, the total impact has been calculated based on the weighted impact of each indicator. The table also shows individual impact scores for each indicator. Based on this data, we can see that the program has had the most impact on adolescents in terms of financial literacy and engagement. 21.5% impact has been calculated for technical knowledge of the girls based on technical skill tests undertaken at the end of the program. Attitudes have also shown a very positive trend of improvement with a 40% increase from baseline to end line results. Level of interest in STEM subjects and higher education among adolescents has also shown good impact of 36%. In addition the 29% increase in positive perceptions of girls in terms of their family support, 19% increase in their perception of soft skill development, and 27% increase in health awareness scores, demonstrate how the program has had significant impact on the girls not only in terms of improvement in technical skills but on their overall development.

## **Short-Term Indicators**

### Indicator 1: Attitudes, self-esteem and confidence levels

Attitudes, self-esteem and confidence level of participants was gauged on the basis of three sub-indicators – More positive outlook to life, More confident to play an active role in their communities and Greater aspirations and career goals. Increase in likert scores and percentage increase in responses to the different sub-indicators between the baseline and endline were used to measure change in attitudes, self-esteem and confidence of participants before and after the training period. Positive responses (4 and 5) on the Likert Scale were calculated to derive the increase in scores from baseline to end line. Some questions included in this section also involve responses of the telephone interviews.



### 1.1 More positive outlook on life, compared to before the training

The extent up to which adolescent girls played an important role in their families was measured on a Likert scale. The participants who responded positively increased by little more than 20% in the endline study as compared to the baseline. This points out to the fact that the training equipped adolescent girls to contribute and be active members in their families. With regards to gender perception and whether or not women can do any job as well as men, majority of the participants 'agreed' and 'strongly agreed' with 57.35% in the baseline scores and an increase to 70.86% in the endline. From the baseline to end line there was a marked change in the perception of women in terms of their ability to contribute financially to their families as can be seen in 24% positive responses in the baseline and 40% positive responses in the endline. From the telephone interview, we learnt that 91% women feel more independent post the training.

### 1.2 More confident to play an active role in their communities



No. of responses in terms of difficulties faced were stated by 39 women in the baseline study, which reduced to 12 women in the endline. The problems they faced included restrictions on moving out of the house, no options for education and not being encouraged by their families, financial issues, job opportunities and health issues. From this it could be concluded that women gain a more in-depth understanding of their potential and ways to overcome issues.

However, when asked if the situation can be improved, the positive responses were more during the baseline than the end line. This can be attributed to a realisation of the poor family support and objective thinking that the training brought about in the participants, since most problems mentioned were societal and external to the women rather than internal.



2 girls were involved in community development efforts as found in the telephone interviews whereas 98% girls are still to initiate or partake in community development activities.





In the baseline only 78 responses were received on girl's career goals, which increased to 169 in the endline, showing a score increase of 117%. Goals stated in the end line were to study further, get a job, become self reliant, set up their own business and support their family, in order of maximum responses to minimum responses.

### **Indicator 2: Soft Skills**

For a clear picture on the level of soft skills in the trainees and more specifically the changes that have happened pre and post training, the following sub-indicators were assessed – communication skills, leadership knowhow, time and stress management.



A 21% increase was seen between baseline and endline with respect to the participant being able to speak in front of a crowd. Similarly, an analysis of the cumulative data of participants who 'agreed' and 'strongly agreed' to being able to maintain eye contact during a conversation showed an increase of 11% between the baseline and endline – from 59.56% to 70.2%.



# Number of responses on leadership qualities increased from 117 in the baseline to 152 in the endline. This is attributed to the training on leadership components to the girls. The number of positive responses on time management practices increased by 25% with 41% positive responses in the baseline and 66% in the endline. The percentage of participants who said they could look at their problems objectively and find solutions to them increased to 62% in the endline. This reflects a 9% positive impact between baseline and endline for participant's ability to manage stressful situations.



To access the improvement brought about in participants technical skills after involvement in the Women@Work program, the exposure to and regularity in the usage of computers as well as the purpose of usage was looked at. The baseline recorded 26% respondents who use computers at least once a week. In the end line 28% respondents stated to be using computers at least once a week. As can be seen, the training did not impact this aspect much. However, one observation of the data was that the percentage of girls who used computers for recreation reduced from 67% in the baseline to 29% in the end line, whereas those who use computers for work (word and excel) increased to 65% in the end line from 7% in the baseline.





Number of responses of girls on the non traditional trades they were aware of increased from 112 responses in the baseline to 216 in the end line. Endline responses included occupations like driving, electricians, mobile repairing, plumbers, bus conductors, working in a petrol pump, computer related work, etc. These were mostly stated in the end line study.





125 girls of 151 girls undertook the test. 51 girls (weighted to 73) scored A Grade in the tests, wheres 62 girls (weighted to 88) scored B Grade whereas only 1 girl scored C Grade on the test. The overall percentage impact was calculated by examining the percentage of girls who scored Grade A in the tests, amounting to 41% impact.

### **Indicator 4: Financial literacy and engagement**

Along with skills and training the Women@Work program also aims to inculcate in women the importance of financial management and savings. For this the impact across the following sub-indicators was looked at - knowledge on financial institutions, bank accounts, regularity of visiting the bank and loans availed.



### 4. 1 Awareness of financial institutions

Number of responses on places to make savings in the baseline stood at 118 which increased to 244 responses in the endline. SAATH and SEWA saving options were mostly new to all the participants. More girls were made aware of how to make savings in banks, SHGs, post office, etc.





The number of girls who had bank accounts was 61% at the baseline which increased to 95% in the endline. In the telephone interviews, it was found that only 71% stated to have bank accounts. This could be due to their disengagement with their bank accounts since many times the elders or males of the families handle bank accounts. However we can safely say most girls have been positively impacted in terms of their awareness of financial institutions and saving options. The number of girls who mentioned never visiting the bank was 70% in the baseline which reduced to 53% in the end line and 52% in the telephone interviews which shows a positive trend in terms of girls visiting the bank after the training.



The number of girls who mentioned never taking loans also reduced from 93% in the baseline to 53% in the endline.



### **Indicator 5 : Health Awareness**

The evaluation also looks at the awareness among participants on the availability of facilities for healthcare in their locality. This awareness is the first step towards achieving quality healthcare and holistic health for adolescent girls.



In the endline data adolescent girls showed an increase in their awareness on health facilities with 95.36% being aware about health clinics and hospitals in the area in comparison to the 68.38% in the baseline study.

## **Medium-Term Indicators**

### Indicator 6: Education in STEM Subjects

### 6.1 Interest in pursuing a career in STEM subjects



The interest in STEM related subjects showed an increase on all four subjects with 9% increase in science and maths, a 14% increase in engineering and 11% increase in technology related career. It is still advisable to probe further in this aspect since we feel they need further counselling on types of careers associated with STEM subjects. However an overall increase in the impact score was 11%.



### 6.2 Know-how on STEM subjects

Increase in know-how was not as high as expected, however data does show a positive trend. Overall impact was 8% with maths know-how increase at 5%, science at 9%, engineering at 12% and technology at 6%.

### 6.3 Education Status



Since the telephone interviews were carried out only three months after the training, no real change was recorded in terms of girls going back to school or starting to pursue STEM related careers or education. However it was seen that most girls who were in school had one or more of the subjects in their curriculum. 13% girls were seen to be studying and 13% were pursuing one or more STEM subject in their education.

### Indicator 7: Family support and girl's role in her family

The support received and role played by a girl in her family is a major determinant of her self-confidence and self-worth. The Women@Work program with its objective of providing skill training and thus employment opportunities to women and adolescent girls is a step towards building a strong position for them in their families.



With regards to adolescent girls being consulted for family decisions and their families being supportive of their individual decisions, there was an improvement between baseline and endline but for both components the telephonic data showed an even more marked increase with 94.86% of the participants saying their families were supportive of their decisions and 85.29% saying they were consulted for major family decisions. More than 75% of the total participants in the baseline study said that they were supported by their families to pursue careers. The number of adolescent girls who were supported by their families progressively increased in the endline study and telephonic interview.

The families of adolescent girls were primarily supportive of them working in non-traditional trades with 77.21% and 82.12% girls in the baseline and endline respectively saying that their families had no opposition to them taking up work in sectors that are not generally engaged in by women.



# Women

## Demographics

The demographic profile of 356 women is outlined below. Details on the trainees include their religion, level of education, employment status and income levels. We further explored their motivations behind joining the program and family support.

Under the Women@Work Program 'women' comprise of all participants above 18 years of age. In the current **study 356 out of the 507 trainees (70.21%)** fell under the above mentioned category. This has been further sub-categorized as those in the age group of 18 to 25 and those above 25 years, with the former making up for 59.17% of the total women participants.

Half i.e. 51.90% of all women were married and little less than half i.e. 44.90% were unmarried. The remainder were either divorced or widowed with 1.46% of the responses being unrecorded.



### Majority of the women i.e. 73.88%

belonged to the Hindu religion. 20.22% belonged to the Muslim religion and 5.90% responses stand as unrecorded.

**39.04% of women studied** up to high school followed by 28.37% with primary education. One of the respondents had completed post-graduation. Illiteracy rates stood at 2.25% among this group. 10.96% of the responses have not been recorded.



A little more than half of the women i.e. **53.09% were engaged primarily in household chores and activities.** Other livelihood activities that were undertaken included managing own business, beautician and tailoring assignments, jobs like Anganwadi worker, teacher, masonry and contract based labour. 13.48% of the women were still studying. A large number of women, 64.61%, stated that they would like to avail employment opportunities while 21.35% were not keen. 14.04% of the responses are not recorded.

The top reasons stated as motivation for joining the training program were to have better opportunities for growth in income (35.96%), to avail a job (16.57%) and due to an interest in the subjects offered (16.29%). Learning new skills and profession shift were the lowest stated reasons for joining the training.

**78.36% families** were not supportive of women's decision to work in non-traditional trade – a substantial barrier that needed to be overcome during the program.





As per the baseline data, 36% women stated their household income to be below Rs. 10,000, while 26% respondents have household incomes below Rs. 20,000. As for personal incomes, 91% women did not earn an income while 8% earned below Rs. 10,000 per month.

## **Evaluation findings**

| Short- Term<br>Indicators                        | Sub-Indicator                              | Measurement   | Impact | Average<br>Impact | Weighted<br>Impact |
|--|--|---|--------|-------------------|--------------------|
|  |  | Role in Family  | 19%    |                   |                    |
|  | More positive                              | Women can do job as<br>men  | 17%    |                   |                    |
|  | outlook on life                            | Financial contribution  | 8%     |                   |                    |
| A  |  | Independent post<br>training                                      | 94%    |                   |                    |
| Attitudes<br>(5%)                                | More confident<br>to play an active        | Encounter problems<br>as women                                    | 10%    | 32.4%             | 1.62%              |
|  | role in the<br>community                   | Involved in<br>community<br>development efforts                   | 4%     |                   |                    |
|  | Greater<br>aspirations and<br>career goals | Top life-goals  | 75%    |                   |                    |
|  | Better                                     | Confident in speaking<br>in front of crowd                        | 22%    | 35.4%             | 1.77%              |
|  | communication<br>skills                    | Can maintain eye<br>contact during<br>conversation                | 22%    |                   |                    |
| Soft Skills<br>(5%)                              | Aware of<br>leadeship<br>qualities         | Top qualities of a<br>leader                                      | 83%    |                   |                    |
|  | Time-<br>Management<br>Skills              | Organizes daily<br>schedule and sticks to<br>it                   | 26%    |                   |                    |
|  | Aware of stress<br>management<br>methods   | Can look at problems<br>objectively and find<br>solutions to them | 24%    |                   |                    |
|  |  | Technical exam scores   | 51%    |                   | 2.93%              |
| Technical skills                                 | Increase in exposure to                    | Computer Usage  | 23.91% | 29.33%            |                    |
| (10%)  | technology                                 | Weekly Computer<br>usage  | 13%    |                   |                    |
| Financial<br>Literacy and<br>Management<br>(15%) | Aware of<br>financial<br>institutions      | Top places for making<br>savings                                  | 66.67% |                   |                    |
|  | Bank Accounts                              | Has a bank account  | 13.70% | 33.42%            | 5.58%              |
| (1370)   | Level of savings                           | No. of people who are<br>now saving                               | 16%    |                   |                    |

| Short- Term<br>Indicators | Sub-Indicator                | Measurement                                     | Impact | Average<br>Impact | Weighted<br>Impact |
|---------------------------|------------------------------|---|--------|-------------------|--------------------|
| Financial                 | Bank accounts                | Regularity of visiting<br>the bank              | 29.74% |                   |                    |
| Literacy and              | Access to Credit             | Never availed of loans                          | 24.49% |                   |                    |
| Management                | Bank linkages                | No. of women<br>connected to banks<br>for loans | 72.47% |                   |                    |
| Health<br>(5%)            | Awareness on<br>institutions | Institutions mentioned                          | 11.08% | 11.08%            | 0.6%               |

| Medium- Term<br>Indicators            | Sub-Indicator   | Measurement   | Impact | Average<br>Impact | Weighted<br>Impact |
|---------------------------------------|---|---|--------|-------------------|--------------------|
| Femily                                | Family<br>acceptance of<br>the chosen<br>career                     | Family is supportive of<br>the decision to work<br>in non-traditional<br>trades | 22%    |                   | 6.28%              |
| Family<br>support and<br>women's role | Level of stress<br>faced by the girl                                | Family is supportive of decisions   | 37%    | 31.75%            |                    |
| in the family<br>(20%)                | (at home/in<br>society  | Family supports<br>pursuing careers   | 20%    | 51.7570           | 0.2076             |
| (20%)                                 | Change of status<br>in the family<br>(economic,<br>decision making) | Consulted for major<br>decisions in the family                                  | 48%    |                   |                    |
|                                       | Level of<br>employment<br>(part-time/full-<br>time                  | Currently has a job   | 19%    |                   |                    |
| Employment                            | Number of new<br>networks created<br>for participants               | New networks have<br>been accessed since<br>the training                        | 15%    |                   |                    |
| status                                |   | Placement Rate  | 17%    | 20.71%            | 4.12%              |
| (20%)                                 |   | Entrepreneurs   | 10%    |                   |                    |
|                                       | Employment  | Non traditional trades  | 21%    |                   |                    |
|                                       | results   | Government schemes<br>availed   | 31%    |                   |                    |
|                                       |   | Linked to employment options  | 32%    |                   |                    |
| Income levels<br>and assets           | Improvement in  | Increase in income<br>(No. of people)   | 85%    | 48.5%             | 7.31%              |
| (20%)                                 | l income levels   | % Increase in income  | 12%    |                   |                    |

## **TOTAL IMPACT - 30.16%**

As can be seen, the total impact score calculated based on the weighted impact of each indicator, amounts to 30.16%. The table also shows individual impact scores for each indicator. Based on this data, we can see that the program has had the most impact on women in terms of increase in income with an impact percentage of 48.5%.

32.4% impact has been recorded for attitudes, 35.4% score has been calculated for soft skills, a positive change of 29.33% has been calculated for women in terms of technical skills based on computer knowledge and technical tests taken by them and 33.42% change has been recorded for financial literacy and engagement.

Medium-term outcomes show high impact too with 31.75% positive increase according to participants, in terms of family support and a 20.71% impact score with regard to employment changes.



## **Short-Term Indicators**

### Indicator 1: Attitudes, self-esteem and confidence levels

Attitudes, self-esteem and confidence level of participants was gauged on the basis of three sub-indicators – more positive outlook to life, more confident to play an active role in their communities and greater aspirations and career goals. Increase in likert scores and percentage increase in responses to the different sub-indicators between the baseline and endline were used to measure change in attitudes, self-esteem and confidence of participants before and after the training period. Positive responses (4 and 5) on the Likert Scale were calculated to derive the increase in scores from baseline to end line. Some questions included in this section also involve responses of the telephone interviews.



### 1.1 More positive outlook on life, compared to before the training

From 53% positive responses (scores) in the baseline the number of women who replied in the positive in terms of the role they play in their families increased to 72%, recording an increase in scores by 19%. The perception of the trainees in terms of equality between women and men to undertake jobs also changed by 17% from baseline to end line scores. When asked if they could contribute financially, positive responses were lesser than the other questions but also showed a positive change of 8% in the perception scores. At the telephone interview, women were asked if post the training they feel more independent and 94% replied in the positive.

### 1.2 More confident to play an active role in their communities



In the baseline study, 149 women (43%) stated facing no problems as women. This changed to 181 women (53%) who stated having no problems after the training. From this it could be concluded that women gain a more in-depth understanding of their potential and ways to overcome issues. Problems mentioned by women included lack of independence and mobility, lack of education, financial and health concern, managing household responsibilities and pursuing a career, etc.

However, when asked if the situation can be improved, the positive responses were more during the baseline than the end line. This can be attributed to a realisation of the poor family support and objective thinking that the training brought about in the participants, since most problems mentioned were societal and external to the women rather than internal.



14 women were involved in community development efforts as found in the telephone interviews whereas 96% women are still to initiate or partake in community development activities.



### 1.3 Career goals and aspirations

In the baseline, we only received 268 life goal responses whereas in the end line we received 469 responses on life goals. This shows a 75% increase in responses mentioned. The life goals were being a support for the their family, getting a job, educating their children, starting a business, in order of maximum responses to lower recorded responses.

### **Indicator 2: Soft Skills**

### 2.1 Better communication skills



Trends in improvement of communication skills were analysed on grounds of the participant's ability to speak in front of a crowd and also maintain eye contact during conversation. Between the baseline study and endline study there was a 22% increase from 34.11% to 55.87% - in the number of respondents who felt confident to speak in front of a crowd. Similarly on a Likert scale to understand a participant's ability to maintain eye contact, a positive trend was seen between the baseline and endline scores. The data reflects a 22% increase in the scores, with 50% of the baseline participants saying they could maintain eye contact during a conversation and 72% participants being able to do the same in the endline.



100

0

### 2.2 Leadership knowhow

200

300

400

In the baseline, women stated only 212 qualities of a leader as against 389 responses in the endline, marking a 83% increase in responses. The leadership qualities mentioned in the end line were more theoretical and focused on individual attributes of a person, as against the ones mentioned at the baseline which were very generic responses.
## 2.3 Time Management



To gauge time-management skills, the participant's ability to have a plan and stick to it was assessed using a likert scale. Positive response scores were 51% in the baseline which increased to 77% in the endline, showing a positive increase of 26%.

## 2.4 Stress Management



The total likert score for this question increased from 1117 in the baseline to 1288 in the endline, showing a positive increase. Positive response scores increased from 45% to 69%, recording a positive impact of 24%.

## **Indicator 3: Technical Skills**

To access the improvement brought about in participant's technical skills after involvement in the Women@Work program, the exposure to and regularity in the usage of computers, as well as the purpose of usage was looked at.



## 3.1 Exposure to technology (computers)

The women's exposure to and usage of computers was analyzed across the baseline, endline and telephone interviews. In comparison to the baseline, where only 9.04% of the total number of women were recorded as using computers, there is a marked improvement in the endline where the percentage of computer users increased by 23.34%. Telephone interview data showed that only 16.34% women now use computers. This could be because not too many people have personal computers in their homes and their usage increased during the training period when they had access to computers.



To analyze the regularity in usage of computers, participants who accessed computers at least once a week were taken into consideration. Data reflects a 13% positive impact, with weekly usage increasing from 13% in the baseline to 26% in the endline. During the baseline study equal number of participants stated that they used computers primarily for Word and Excel work or for entertainment and recreation. In comparison, the endline data clearly shows that the usage for Word and Excel almost doubled from 6% to 26% between the baseline and the endline study. This points out to a change in perception among the women on the utility of computers.





279 of 356 women undertook the test. 141 women (weighted to 180) scored A Grade in the tests, wheres 62 women (weighted to 151) scored B Grade whereas 20 women (weighted to 26) scored C Grade on the test. The overall percentage impact was calculated by examining the percentage of girls who scored Grade A in the tests, amounting to a 51% impact score.

## **Indicator 4: Financial literacy and engagement**

Along with skills and training the Women@Work program also aims to inculcate in women the importance of financial management and savings. For this the impact across the following sub-indicators were looked at – financial assets like bank accounts and loans availed, level of income and savings. 258 women were linked with financial institutions for loan, insurance, opening new bank accounts and inculcating the habit of saving. It was observed that many owned a bank account but were not active and no transactions were done so for activating it, we have made efforts to explain them the importance of saving and they are now saving Rs 500 to Rs 1000 per month on an average.

## Institutions mentioned (No. of responses) Baseline Endline % of change in scores

## 4.1 Aware of financial institutions

The top options for making savings across the baseline and endline studies included both formal (banks, Self-Help Groups, post-office, SAATH bank) as well as informal (home, piggy bank) institutions. While banks were the most preferred choice during both baseline and endline, there was a fall in the percentage of women saving at banks to 34.16% in the endline study as compared to 43.01% in the baseline study. Specifically in SAATH banks, number of women saving increased from 1.94% to 5.19% post the training.





The percentage of women who made savings on a monthly basis increased from 28% to 44% between the baseline and endline. On the other hand, number of women who had no savings at all decreased by 16% in the endline study. Another noteworthy finding is that during the telephonic interview majority of the women were recorded as saving more than Rs. 1000 per month. In the baseline and endline study an extremely marginal number of women could achieve monthly savings up to that level.

## 4.3 Bank Accounts



No. of women who had bank accounts increased from 57% in the baseline to 71% in the end line and then reduced during telephone interviews to 67%. This could be because other people in the family operate the accounts of women and girls. 68% women did not regularly access their bank accounts which reduced to 38% in the end line study, showing a positive influence on banking engagements of women after the training.



4.4 Access to credit



While the endline study showed an increase in the number of women who availed loans it can also be inferred from the data that most women post the training stated they would avail loans from formal institutions. Women who stated to avail of loans from banks increased from 6.71% to 24.93%. Another positive impact is that there was a small but considerable growth in women talking about availing loans from SAATH bank – from a meagre 0.29% to 3.15%.



## **Indicator 5: Health Awareness**

The evaluation also looks at the awareness among women on the availability of facilities for healthcare in their locality. This awareness is the first step towards achieving quality healthcare and holistic health for women.



With 77.26% women in the baseline study being aware of local facilities for healthcare there was an increase by approximately 10% in the endline where 88.25% women were aware of healthcare facilities in the area.

# **Medium-Term Indicators**

## Indicator 6: Family support and women's role in her family

The support received and role played by a woman in her family is a major determinant of her self-confidence and self-worth. The Women@Work program with its objective of providing skill training and thus employment opportunities to women and adolescent girls is a step towards building a strong position for women in their families.



## 6.1 Family support

A positive trend is evident in the family support received by the participant for her decision as well as in women being consulted for major family decisions. Increases of almost 20-30% were seen between the baseline and endline study and consequently between the endline and telephonic interview data. Similarly, data across the baseline and telephonic interview measuring the support received by women from their families increased from 75.8% positive responses in the baseline to 95.33% in the telephonic interview. To gauge the extent to which family members were adjusting to and accepting the participants' involvement in non-traditional trades the telephonic interview looked at this component. 78% women stated that their families were not supportive of them engaging in non-traditional trades.



## 6.1 Status in family (economic, decision making)



39% women felt their families involved them in key decisions in the baseline which increased to 68% in the end line and even further increased to 86% in the telephone interviews.

## **Indicator 7: Employment Status**

The key objective of the Women@Work program is to improve employment opportunities for women. Thus, to evaluate women's employment status, their participation in the work sector and the nature of employment engaged in was looked at.



## 6.1 Employment levels

Out of the total women participants only 3.50% had jobs during the baseline study. This increased to 10.89 % in the endline and even further to 22.28% in the telephonic interview. Thus, a progressive rise can be pointed out in levels of employment. It is also important to note that 20.4% of the participants were studying during the telephonic interviews.

## Internal Monitoring Results (SAATH data)

To corroborate our findings and receive actual numbers on placements, entrepreneurial ventures, type of employment for women, etc. SAATH team provided us with the following information to be included in our final calculations.

| Indicator                    | No. of women | % impact |
|------------------------------|--------------|----------|
| Increase in income           | 303          | 85       |
| Market linkages              | 56           | 15.73    |
| Placement rate               | 58           | 16.29    |
| Entrepreneurs                | 37           | 10.39    |
| Non-traditional trades       | 16           | 4.49     |
| Linked to employment options | 113          | 31.74    |
| Linked to loans              | 258          | 72.47    |

- Women who underwent the electrician course were placed in four companies in electrical departments. The companies were Yazaki Pvt. Ltd., Navkar Engineers, Vikas Charger making and Ford Motors. 25 girls were placed in petrol pumps of Shell and Bharat Petroleum. They earn Rs 8,500 per month, are liable for medical insurance, bonus, incentives and are offered a meal a day. 4 girls got jobs in mobile stores and Idea Care. 9 women have got small electrical jobs in their vicinity. A new partnership was formed with a placement agency called JV management which assisted the SAATH team to find jobs for their trainees. In addition to these results, SAATH is still trying to support trainees with the help of it's two new initiatives- Livelihood Resource Centre and Business Gym.
- 20 women have started their own business in their interest areas, while 12 started their electrician shops and 4 started their mobile repairing shops.

| Companies   | Designation   | Monthly salary (Rs.) | No of Trainees Placed |
|---|---------------|----------------------|-----------------------|
| <ul> <li>Yazaki PVT LTD</li> <li>Ford Motors</li> <li>Navkar engineering</li> <li>Vikas Charger Making</li> </ul> | Line operator | 9,000 - 10,400       | 23                    |
| Shell Petrol Pump   | Filler        | 8,500                | 25                    |
| Mobile stores   | Executive     | 4,000 - 6,000        | 4                     |
| Electrical jobs   | Helper        | 4,000 - 6,000        | 9                     |
| Total Placement   |               |                      | 61                    |

| No of entrepreneurs | Type of businesses | Monthly income (Rs.) |
|---------------------|--------------------|----------------------|
| 12                  | Electrician        | 2,000 - 6,000        |
| 4                   | Mobile repairing   | 4,000 - 6,000        |
| 20                  | Other businesses   | 2,000 - 12,000       |

- Women engaged in tailoring usually purchase material and other requirements from local retailers. This adds to their cost and reduces profit margins. Through this program women were informed on the benefits of buying from local whole sale markets like Dhalgadwad, Rewdi bazaar, etc. Many women now purchase bulk material collectively, which reduces their costs and improves their incomes.
- The same was suggested to women who own beauty parlours, who now purchase stock and equipment from wholesale markets like Pankor Naka. 56 women have been linked in similar ways to the market, who are apart from the 58 women who have been provided with placements.
- SAATH also helped establish linkages of fruit and vegetable vendors with hotel and restaurants so that they can sell in bulk and earn higher incomes. This linkage is provided only to those who had attended the Micro entrepreneurship training.
- Market linkages and placements have been provided to many women but there are certain challenges like women do not want to leave their vicinity, they want to do job nearby their areas. Observing these demands of those women who are not working SAATH has connected and counselled them with the "SAATH Job Centre". The centre aims at providing more employment opportunities to the unemployed youth of the urban centres.
- Most women felt they have been connected to useful institutions through this training program, the primary ones being the local *Mahila Mandals* and the SAATH network.

| Government Schemes   | Number of beneficiaries |   |
|--|-------------------------|---|
| <i>Shramjeevi Yojna</i> (specific for women in the informal sector), Minority scholarships, <i>Ghar guar Divda, Kuwarbai nu mameru</i> | 3.                      | 5 |
| Adhar Card   | 5                       | 5 |
| PAN Card<br>Election Card  | 1                       | 9 |
| Total beneficiaries  | 10                      | 9 |

## Access to Government Schemes

## **Post Training Qualitative Assessment**

We asked participants about specific aspects they learnt at the training. Here are some responses on what they learnt related to the 5 main subject areas of life skills.

- 1. Communication skills
  - Talk in a way that people understand you
  - Talk about what's important
  - Talk calmly and softly
  - Make eye contact while talking
  - Keep control on anger
  - Have self confidence
  - Think before talking
  - Be courteous
  - Talk nicely to everyone even if they are elder or younger to you
- 2. Time management
- Get up early and finish work on time
- Reach places on time
- According to the work on hand decide the plan
- First finish the household work and then go outside
- Take out time to learn a skill
- Don't waste time
- Make a daily time table according to priority

#### 3. Stress management

- Believe in yourself
- Think through a problem and then come to a solution

- Take your parents suggestion and then think about solutions

- First understand the problem and then figure solutions

- Work so that you can earn and reduce the financial strain in your house

- 4. Financial management
- Spend only when required
- Have savings
- Spend the savings to buy things important to business

5. Health

- Wash hands with Dettol
- Regular bathing
- Keep surroundings clean
- Eat healthy
- Wash hands before eating
- Eat on time

Other questions were asked on entrepreneurship and Government schemes. Some noteworthy learning among participants included that all participants could point out production expenditures of a tailor and other businesses. Only three women out of 40 were not able to explain what a SWOT analysis is. All the women knew a minimum of two Government schemes. The most common schemes were Avas yojna, Kuvarbhai nu Mameru, Ghar ghar divda, Swarojgari yojna, Pension, student scholarships and Swaran Jayanti. All the women were able to give three features of a good business, while more than 70% mentioned more aspects too. The main aspects mentioned were financial skills, good behaviour with customer, marketing, good location, good service and quality of the product. Some of the women also mentioned that it is important to calculate business opportunity and risk involved before starting out. While talking to participants, it was very evident that they definitely have learnt a lot of theory on micro-entrepreneurship and have been given ample knowledge and exposure on life skills, financial linkages, Government schemes and an overall positive sense of belonging.

# **Training Feedback**

## **Participant Feedback**



No. of women who stated aspects were 'Extremely Useful)



As can be seen from the above graphs, all participants rated the training on various components over 80%. We further questioned women on the impact the various modules have had on them which also shows that for all modules, women rated them as extremely useful and somewhat useful. Very low percentages were recorded for not at all useful.

Trainers and parents were also asked to rank the changes in participants with regard to the identified indicators. From the data it was found that parents saw maximum impact on trainees in terms of financial literacy, self esteem & confidence and family support and girl's role in a family. Trainers saw maximum impact in self esteem & confidence, soft skills and technical skills. Scores given by trainers were considerably lower than scores given by participant's parents.



### Family emerged as the highest priority according to participants, followed by money.

Based on the ranking exercise, 71.43% priority was attached to family, while money was pinned at 68.22%. Independence was rated at 59.18%. Careers, education and job satisfaction were scored at around 60%.



## **Trainer Feedback**

 "Even with low education qualifications, women can be a part of this program and learn a livelihood skill which can help them contribute financially at home."
 Dharmishtha Parmar, Female, 29, Sarkhej Center

2) "The program enables women to gain a practical understanding on working in nontraditional trades and understand various livelihood options so they could be independent."

- Hakim Shama, Male, 36, Fatewadi Centre

3) "Women are not motivated to become earning members of their families while girls are persuaded to study ahead. They are further helped to be independent and motivated to start their own entrepreneurial ventures."

- Surendrasinh Chauhan, Male, 27 Meghaninagar Centre

4) "Since the program is in the vicinity of the participants, it is easier for them to come regularly and do not face as many issues in terms of the family accepting their participation in the program."

-Ashvini Parmar, Female, 21

5) "Non traditional skills should be combined with some training on traditional women centric trades as well. This might increase the number of enrolled participants." - Hansa Makwana, Female, 37

## Parent Feedback

1) "I have seen a significant change in my daughter's behaviour and aspirations in just a few weeks of her undertaking the training. She is now clearly able to express herself and the goals she has for herself. She comes across as an informed confident and independent girl since the training."

- Abdulgami Sama, 49, father of participant who enrolled in mobile repairing training

2) "My wife knows so much more about health and hygiene issues post the training. Her attitude is more positive and she now contributes to the household income. Her knowledge about saving and finance is commendable in such a short time. I am very happy she attended the program."

- Shama Hakim Ismail, 39, husband of participant who enrolled in mobile repairing training

3) "The training program has helped me understand how my wife can contribute to our household income. Since the training, I have seen the increase in her self confidence and her knowledge on important things like savings, health, employment options, starting a small business, etc. She took the electrician course for two months and through small odd jobs in the vicinity, now makes Rs.4000 per month. I cannot be more thankful to SAATH for a platform this this."

- Siddharth Patiyar, 36, husband of participant who enrolled in electrician training

## **Participant stories**



16-year-old Heena lives in Behrampura slum area of Ahmedabad. She lost her father during her childhood after which her mother was the sole bread earner in her family consisting of herself, her sister and brother. Heena has studied till 8th standard while her younger sister and brother are currently studying in primary school. Heena's mother was forced into labour work to support her family but the social stigma attached to being a widow and the economic crisis made her family situation traumatic. Hearing about the SAATH program Heena decided to enroll herself and her mother into the program, to improve their livelihood options. According to Heena, "I wasn't able to understand my mother's situation before but now I understand the responsibility on her shoulders. I now help my mother in every way I can and I've decided that after the training I'll start looking for options to start a small business of my own to support my family. I'm thankful to SAATH for opening up this new opportunity for me".



Khodiyarnagar is a small slum located in the Behrampura area. Nilamben lives in this area with her husband, motherin-law, two daughters and one son. Nilamben and her husband have both studied till 8th standard. Her husband was working in a shop and was earning Rs. 6,000 per month. Since the last 2 years, he is suffering from AIDS and due to this he is not able to do any kind of work. The family is in a financial crunch as his medical expenses are increasing day by day. Due to the responsibility of the house and the children, Nilamben started looking for some work. Nilamben's mother-in-law also started labour work. In November 2015, Nilamben met the mobilization team of Women@Work.

Nilamben keenly took the information about the program and after getting all the information, Nilamben found hope for her family's future and joined the training. After the training she got an opportunity to work at Shell petrol pump near her area. She now earns Rs. 8,500 per month, which helps her to support her family. "Women at work has not only given me a way for solving all the problems of my family but also it has empowered me to stand on my own feet" says Nilamben with pride.



Hemangini lives in Sakharchand Mukhinichali, Behrampura area of Ahmedabad. Her family comprises of her sick father, mother, younger brother and two elder brothers who live separately with their wives and children. Her father started keeping unwell since three years, which has resulted in a financial crisis in the family. Both her elder brothers have not been supporting her father, so she was forced to drop out of school after passing class 10th. She started working in a private school, where she got a mere salary of Rs. 1,500/per month. Hearing about the program, she decided it was a god opportunity and enrolled in the program. During the training phase, for the first time in her life, Hemangani was asked to think about her dreams and aspirations, which was a very introspective moment for her. Post the training, she says she can now communicate well with anyone. After the training she continued with her job at the private school, and kept searching for better job opportunities. This led her to interview for the job to work in Shell Petrol pump. SAATH team members helped her prepare for the interview and she was offered the job at Rs.8000 per month with incentives. Hemangini is very satisfied with the salary and now she can financially support her family much better than before.

Kashmira Mahesh Bhai Sonavni resides in Parikshit Nagar, Behrampura area of Ahmedabad. She is a bright 22-year-old woman. Her family comprises of parents and two brothers. Father is an auto driver and mother is domestic worker. She

had dropped out of school, when she was unable to pass class 10th. Father's monthly income at times varies and he is unable to earn enough, thus that creates problems at times. During the road show of women at work, Kashmira came to know about the different non-traditional trades imparted to women and adolescents. After dropping out of school, she has been at home, without any constructive engagement besides watching TV and household work. She wanted to learn something new and useful, and got enrolled for the trade of electrician. During the training, she was taught about life skills and nuances of micro-entrepreneurship, over and above the technical training of the electrician trade. She is satisfied with the training that has been imparted to her, because this has earned her a distinctive identity in the



locality. She is the first electrician from her locality, which fills Kashmira and her family with a sense of pride and satisfaction. After the training was over, the Women at work team took her for a campus interview, at the Ford Motors campus at Balva. She was selected as a line operator at Ford Motors with a starting salary of Rs. 10,400/- per month. The company is also providing her pick and drops facility, two meals and provident fund as additional benefits. After joining, she has also acquired technical training from Ford, which has further enhanced her technical skills and knowledge. Her story is a source of pride for the women at work team and SAATH.

Muskaan Sheikh Akbar Husain, resides near Naseem Parlour in Fatehwadi area of Ahmedabad. She is an 18-year-old girl. Her parents had got separated when she was still a child, and thereafter her grandmother had brought her up. The household income was not sufficient; hence she could not continue her education. Her family comprises of grandparents and maternal uncle. The maternal uncle is the sole bread earner of the family. Her grandmother is a household help and goes for work from one house to another. Muskaan also started working as a domestic worker just like her grandmother. The family's low economic condition and lack of education among the family members did not create the supportive environment for her to pursue her studies further. This is a great regret for Muskaan, that she couldn't continue her education. She wanted to learn certain skills, which would help her to get empowered. She wanted to acquire some hands on experience, thus she joined a nearby factory unit, for learning some new



employable skills while being at work. Muskaan heard about the training from her cousin sister. She collected the basic information about the course at the training centre and thereafter got enrolled for mobile repairing training. She learnt the theoretical aspects of mobile repairing, along with practical and passed the assessment at the end of 2 months training. Apart from this she learnt about money management, how to do bank transactions, processes of availing micro credit for starting micro-enterprise. She was also taught about the does and don'ts of handling and managing tools and instruments meant for mobile

repairing. The women at work team made sure that she acquires skills and imbibes behaviour meant for the work place. Although she has not started her own shop, she has started repairing mobiles of other shops, which is helping her acquire a decent income. In the near future she aspires to start her own mobile repairing shop, with her own savings.

Rumana Saiyad is residing in the Lalbaug, Fatehwadi area of Ahmedabad. She is a 21 year old woman. When Saath started training non-traditional trades for women like that of electrician and mobile repairing course in Fatehwadi, Rumana came to know about the course from her sister. Thereafter she came to the training center and gathered information about the training programme. After that she got enrolled for the training, which she found to be very interesting. She felt that the course has the potential of linking her to employment opportunities at the call centres and also supports girls to start own micro-enterprise. During the training phase, she learnt all the basics of mobile repairing and according to Rumana the training was very effective. As a result of the training, her communication skills and time management got enhanced. She also learnt about how to work in a group and deliver results on time. The women at work trainer informed her that Idea care and Vodafone care was started in Fatehwadi, where she can find a job. Since she was keen on getting employed immediately after the training, she immediately accepted the job offer without any delay. She was offered a salary of Rs. 5000/- per month. She has been regular and punctual at her work place and been delivering her work efficiently, as stated by her employers.

# Media Coverage



Dhrasti Organisation, which works on highlighting social issues took an interview of participants of the training programme to broadcast their stories and impact of the program, on their radio channel.

# Learning and Recommendations

#### Space constraints

The training was originally planned to be implemented at four centres. Owing to the target numbers and interest expressed by people in various slums, the training is eventually being conducted in seven centres. Since women also did not wish to travel to existing Saath centres for training due to social constraints, the centres were then opened in the vicinity of the participants. The space for training was also searched by women who wanted to join the course. Training spaces in new identified slum areas are difficult to rent. This is because there are not many options to rent, and the available ones are expensive. For this reason, some centres are very poorly ventilated and cramped. This does not make for a very conducive learning environment.

#### Few computers at the training centre

All trainers stated the lack of computers at the training centres as the main issue of the program. During technology training sessions, many women are unable to proactively work on computers owing to the dearth of computers available. This also reduces the interest of participants and leads to drop-outs.

#### **Religious issues**

The concept of savings is difficult to promote among muslim participants. According to Islam paying or receiving any form of interest is against the religion.

#### Low attendance among girls

Many girls/ women are solely responsible for all household chores and are unable to attend classes regularly. Exams and festivals affect attendance of girls. Women who have children record low attendance. Looking at this issue, women were allowed to bring their children to the training.

## Disinterest in non-traditional trades among women

Majority women/girls prefer tailoring, owning a beauty parlour, or any household work. The idea of moving out of their house, going to work and engaging in something so new and radical is not very acceptable to some.

### Prefer locally available work

Even though placements have been offered to trainees, many reject the offer since they demand work in their vicinity (or home based work), not involving any travel. This is owing to both - costs and family concerns on safety.

### Difficulties in availing credit

On completion of micro-entrepreneur training, if girls are interested in starting their own venture, financial linkages are difficult to provide. All banks and other credit organisations demand security against loan allotment. This makes it difficult for parents and girls to avail credit, since they don't have high valued assets. This eventually leads to discouragement among girls and their families, and see the training as a fruitless exercise.

#### Age as a barrier

The program engages with girls who are at a crucial age in India, to get married. Parents are more concerned about her getting married than undertaking a course. On the contrary, they also feel she is too young and immature to start her own business or learn about entrepreneurship.

#### Family permissions

There are still many families in slum areas who do not allow girls/women to learn/work in non traditional trades

#### Societal pressures

Many times parents state the reason of societal pressures to enrol their girls into the program. The muslim community of Fatehwadi area, is conservative in their views on women independence and livelihoods, which deters families from going against elders in their communities and allowing the women in their family to enrol in the program.

#### Placements

It is difficult to convince companies and employers to hire women for non traditional trades, as they stereotype women on what they can and cannot do.

#### **Drop-outs**

It has been observed that at the initial level women are motivated to join the training but during follow-up they are found to be demotivated as they do not get required support from the family who have the viewpoint that this kind of technical course is preferred by males only and it is not appropriate for the girls, denying them permission to continue with the program. In the program there were only 3 dropouts which is really low. Those who had dropped out earlier were re-involved in the program with regular counselling.

#### Time constraints of women

It has been observed that many women leave the jobs they are placed in owing to them not able to cope with or adjust to their job timings. This is especially problematic for women working at petrol pumps.

The Women @ Work program which offers training on non-traditional livelihoods and micro entrepreneurship, implemented by SAATH and funded by Empower Foundation aims to provide knowledge and tools to women to develop skills and changes in attitudes and behaviors. It helps women and society at large understand the role gender plays and to acquire the knowledge and skills necessary for advancing gender equality in their daily lives and work.

It is widely accepted that skills development is an essential element in improving the employability and potential productivity of the working poor and can be an important tool for reducing poverty and escaping the vicious circle of inadequate education, poor training, low productivity and poor quality jobs with low wages. Women typically face additional difficulties or discrimination in accessing good quality training and using it to secure better work. It has also been proved that training has a positive effect on mental health and physical health and gives people career progression and promotion opportunities.

Skill development programs for women have shown to have impacts on the local community indirectly through starting enterprises that create employment, contributing to household incomes, introducing innovations and technology that are imitated by neighbours, providing local services (e.g. teachers), providing positive female role models that challenge local perceptions, etc.

The Women @ Work program has proven to contribute to positive change in the women and adolescents' perceptions and skills. The calculation of the impact index shows that the program last year has had a more positive impact in the life of adolescents than women. Recommendations to strengthen the program include -

## 1) Focus on improving training infrastructure

Poorly ventilated and cramped training spaces and a lack of computers has been noted by trainers as the main issue in effective implementation. Solutions to improve both these aspects need to be found and implemented.

## 2) Stronger linkages with recruiting agencies

If the training does not relate to placements and formation of new enterprises, the training is seen as a futile exercise by both trainees and their families. This year the SAATH team should also focus on developing more placement associated partnerships by promoting and advocating the Women @ Work program in a more holistic fashion.

### Create a networking and information space for alumni of the program

If trainees of the program do not step out of the house or use their training post its completion, the desired impact will not be achieved. If women do not have a place where they could meet to discuss their progress or interact with other participants of the program on a regular basis, the long term impact will not be seen. For this reason, a space for community involvement should be created, which will regularly organise meetings and events for alumni.

4) Establish monitoring system for trainers to track more data as per each training session.

To make sure that each session is as impactful as possible, further metrics need to be developed to track inputs and outputs of each training. By doing so fluctuation in participants or content of the training can be observed during the actual program and deviations can be corrected.

To conclude, the Women @ Work program has related to positive change in perceptions and roles of gender in the slum areas of Ahmedabad and beyond. For the next batch of women and girls, learnings should be implemented to even reach bigger impact in the next years of implementing the Women @ Work program.



The true measure of a social program's success is it's ability to bring about a positive change in the everyday life of its beneficiaries. SAATH's Women@Work program did just this. This can be vouched for through beneficiary testimonies saying that the quality of training provided by SAATH was far better than any other training attended by them in the past. It provided an immense opportunity to learn a new livelihood skill and thus better their employment and eventually financial status. To recognize SAATH's contribution to the community, the trainees along with their families and community, awarded 2 of the program trainers - Harshali Wadekar and Vimlaben – with a laughing Buddha statue. This acted as a positive boost for SAATH to continue to work with zeal for the growth and progress of the community.

www.the4thwheel.com